CARLSMITH BALL LLP

IAN L. SANDISON 5597
TIM LUI-KWAN 2271
JOHN P. MANAUT 3989
ASB Tower, Suite 2100
1001 Bishop Street
Honolulu, HI 96813
Tel No. 808.523.2500
Fax No. 808.523.0842
isandison@carlsmith.com
tluikwan@carlsmith.com
JPM@carlsmith.com

RECEIVED
OFFICE OF CONSERVATION
AND COASTAL LANDS

2016 AUG 22 A 11:07

DEPT OF LAND & NATURAL RESOURCES STATE OF HAWAII

Attorneys for Applicant
UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009 CASE NO. BLNR-CC-16-002

THE UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO'S JOINDER TO TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC'S OBJECTIONS TO THE UNTIMELY MOTIONS AND JOINDERS FILED BY ANTI-TMT PARTIES INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO, DOC. NOS 178, 179, 187, 190, 191, 192, 193, and 195, FILED AUGUST 11, 2016 [DOC. 203]; CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

THE UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO'S JOINDER TO TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC'S OBJECTIONS TO THE UNTIMELY MOTIONS AND JOINDERS FILED BY ANTI-TMT PARTIES INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO, DOC. NOs 178, 179, 187, 190, 191, 192, 193, and 195 FILED AUGUST 11, 2016 [DOC. 203]

Applicant UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO ("University"), through its counsel, Carlsmith Ball LLP, joins in TMT International Observatory, LLC's Objections to the Untimely Motions and Joinders Filed by Anti-TMT Parties Including, But Not Limited To, Doc. Nos. 178, 179, 187, 190, 191, 192, 193, and 195, filed on August 11, 2016 [Doc. 203], for the reasons

stated therein.

In Minute Order No. 13 [Doc. 115], the Hearing Officer set a deadline of July 18, 2016 for the filing of pre-hearing motions. See Minute Order No. 13 [Doc. 115] at 6. In defiance of the Hearing Officer's unambiguous order, parties continue to file motions, as well as joinders to motions, well after the imposed deadline. These untimely motions and joinders have caused chaos in this contested case proceeding, forcing the Hearing Officer and involved parties to spend unnecessary time and effort sifting through the numerous improperly filed documents, many of which raise issues that are outside of the Hearing Officer's authority to hear/decide on. Accordingly, the University respectfully requests that the Hearing Officer strike all motions filed after July 18, 2016 and joinders to those motions unless the submission was expressly authorized or the deadline specifically excused by the Hearing Officer.

Separately, the University asserts a standing objection to any further untimely and authorized motions or joinders from being submitted or considered by any party to this proceeding. Allowing further untimely motions and joinders will result in continued and elevated levels of disorder, which will interfere with and restrict the Hearing Officer and involved parties from addressing the critical issues that are properly the subject of this proceeding in an efficient and streamlined manner. Should the Hearing Officer decide to entertain such untimely and unauthorized motions or joinders, the University reserves the right to file a response on the merits at a later date.

Lastly, to the extent that motions for reconsideration are permitted, such motions should be decided by the Hearing Officer without hearing or oral argument, which is the procedure followed in our state and federal courts. The Hawai'i Supreme Court previously expressed its concern for the abuse of motions for reconsideration that merely ask to rehear matters of a purely repetitive nature which "necessarily result in delay and wasted effort by court and counsel."

Gossinger v. Ass'n of Apt. Owners of the Regency of Ala Wai, 73 Haw. 412, 425, 835 P.2d 627, 634 (1992); see also K.M. Young & Assocs., Inc. v. Cieslik, 4 Haw.App. 657, 667, 675 P.2d 793, 801 (1983). If the Hearing Officer elects to treat motions for reconsideration as hearing motions, the University reserves the right to present oral argument regarding such motions.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaiʻi, August 22, 2016.

IAN L. SÁNDISON TIM LUI-KWAN JOHN P. MANAUT

Attorneys for Applicant UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Application (CDUA) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Ka'ohe Mauka, Hāmakua, Hawai'i, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009

Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that the above-referenced document was served upon the

following parties by email unless indicated otherwise:

JUDGE RIKI MAY AMANO (Ret.) rma3cc@yahoo.com

Hearing Officer

MICHAEL CAIN

Office of Conservation and Coastal Lands

1151 Punchbowl Street, Room 131

Honolulu, HI 96813

michael.cain@hawaii.gov

Custodian of the Records(original + digital copy)

DAVE M. LOUIE, ESO. CLIFFORD K. HIGA, ESQ. NICHOLAS R. MONLUX, ESQ.

Kobayashi Sugita & Goda, LLP

dml@ksglaw.com

ckh@ksglaw.com

nrm@ksglaw.com

Special Deputy Attorneys General for ATTORNEY GENERAL DOUGLAS S. CHIN. THE DEPARTMENT OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL, and DEPUTY ATTORNEYS GENERAL IN THEIR CAPACITY AS COUNSEL FOR THE BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES and HEARING

OFFICER

JULIE H. CHINA, ESQ., Deputy Attorney General

julie.h.china@hawaii.gov

WILLIAM J. WYNHOFF, ESQ., Deputy

Attorney General

bill.j.wynhoff@hawaii.gov

Counsel for the BOARD OF LAND AND

NATURAL RESOURCES

J. DOUGLAS ING, ESQ.

douging@wik.com

ROSS T. SHINYAMA, ESQ.

rshinyama@wik.com

Watanabe Ing LLP

Counsel for TMT INTERNATIONAL

OBSERVATORY, LLC

LINCOLN S.T. ASHIDA, ESQ.

lsa@torkildson.com

NEWTON J. CHU, ESQ.

njc@torkildson.com

Torkildson, Katz, Moore, Hetherington & Harris

Counsel for PERPETUATING UNIQUE

EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES (PUEO)

RICHARD NAIWIEHA WURDEMAN, ESQ. rnwurdeman@rnwlaw.com
Counsel for Petitioners MAUNA KEA ANAINA
HOU; CLARENCE KUKAUAKAHI CHING;
FLORES-CASE OHANA; DEBORAH J.
WARD; PAUL K. NEVES; and KAHEA: THE
HAWAIIAN ENVIRONMENTAL ALLIANCE

DWIGHT J. VICENTE 2608 Ainaola Drive Hilo, HI 96720-3538 (no email; mailing address only)

JOSEPH KUALII LINDSEY CAMARA kualiic@hotmail.com

HARRY FERGERSTROM

HARRY FERGERSTROM P.O. Box 951 Kurtistown, HI 96750 hankhawaiian@yahoo.com (via email & U.S. mail) CINDY FREITAS hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com

RICHARD L. DELEON

kekaukike@msn.com

WILLIAM FREITAS pohaku7@yahoo.com

TIFFNIE KAKALIA tiffniekakalia@gmail.com

BRANNON KAMAHANA KEALOHA brannonk@hawaii.edu

GLEN KILA makakila@gmail.com

LANNY ALAN SINKIN

JENNIFER LEINA'ALA SLEIGHTHOLM leina.ala.s808@gmail.com

lanny.sinkin@gmail.com Representative for the Temple of Lono C. M. KAHOʻOKAHI KANUHA kahookahi@gmail.com

KALIKOLEHUA KANAELE akulele@yahoo.com

MEHANA KIHOI uhiwai@live.com

MAELANI LEE maelanilee@yahoo.com

STEPHANIE-MALIA:TABBADA s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net

HARVEY E. HENDERSON, JR., ESQ., Deputy Attorney General harvey.e.hendersonjr@hawaii.gov
Counsel for the Honorable DAVID Y. IGE, and BLNR Members SUZANNE CASE and STANLEY ROEHRIG

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai'i, August 22, 2016.

IAN L. SANDISON TIM LUI-KWAN

JOHN P. MANAUT

Attorneys for Applicant
UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT HILO